

Three Patch Podcast – Episode 35 April 1, 2015

– Sorting Sherlock

Music Voiceover:

John Watson: *We don't know a thing about each other. I don't know where we're meeting. I don't even know your name.*

Sherlock Holmes: *I know you're an army doctor recently invalidated home from Afghanistan. I know you've got a brother who's worried about you, but you won't go to him for help because you don't approve of him, possibly because he's an alcoholic. More likely because he recently walked out on his wife. And I know that your therapist thinks your limp is psychosomatic, quite correctly I'm afraid. It's enough to be going on, don't you think?*

Music fades in/out.

Shannon: Hi everyone, and welcome to the Sorting Sherlock segment. This is Shannon, and it's been a while! But I'm joined by two fellow fans. I'm here with:

Roane: Roane.

Caroline: And Caroline.

Shannon: And for this episode, we're doing a very special sorting. This is kind of a *re-sorting*. We haven't quite done this character in-depth before, although if you do listen to our podcast from 221B con last year, you will hear some attempts to sort this character. And we're doing none other than that bitterest of bitter brothers, Redbeard!

Caroline: *[giggling]* The bitter one.

Roane: Aww! I don't think he could be bitter at all, he's a dog!

[laughter]

Shannon: Okay, all right. *[clears throat]* We'll do the sweetest of sweet brothers, Redbeard! Is that better?

Roane: Yes. Yaaay!

Caroline: I'm not sure he's sweeter than Martin Crieff --

Shannon: Okay! Good god, all right.

All original content: Copyright By Fans 4 Fans, LLC. Promotional graphics were created by Fox Estacado. See our [Terms](#) for details on use.

Suggested Citation Format: By Fans 4 Fans (Producer). (2015, April 1). The Bitter Brother [Episode 35]. Three Patch Podcast. Podcast retrieved from <http://www.three-patch.com/2015/04/01/episode-35-the-bitter-brother/>

Caroline: No, but very sweet, very sweet.

Shannon: That third brother... *[breaks off laughing]* Yeah so, we're sorting Redbeard again. And we had a little help with these questions because obviously, when sorting an animal, we're faced with a few challenges, because looking to the Harry Potter texts, we don't see as much indication about how an animal might be sorted if they were to attend Hogwarts, because aside from werewolves who are -- well, what do you guys consider them? Animals or humans or something else?

Roane: Ehh. They're...humans? I mean, they're magical creatures that are sentient.

Shannon: Right.

Roane: I mean, I think that's the line. They're sentient.

Shannon: They're sentient. Okay. So well, I'm presuming that Redbeard is also quite sentient and pretty clever.

Roane: This is true.

Shannon: So, we think it's feasible therefore that we could sort Redbeard. Although, he may not count as a magical creature or a witch or a wizard. Although maybe we have some evidence from the series so far to suggest otherwise. So we're going to try sorting him. And we went to one of our consulting friends for help on coming up with questions that would get truly at the character of Redbeard. And most of the questions you will hear today were developed by our very own Dixie, so --

Roane: *[laughing]* I should've known!

[laughter]

Shannon: So let's started. So the first question, guys. Dixie thought that this was a key one. What kind of cake does Redbeard like, and does he let Mycroft have any?

Roane: I have to say that I wanted to be on this roundtable because anyone who knows me at all knows that I'm a major dog person.

Shannon: Mm hmm.

Roane: And so, you know, I was happy to see Redbeard in the series. Based on my personal experience with dogs, being an Irish Setter I think is kind of hard to tell, but based on my experience with Irish Setters, but, based on my experience with dogs, I think *any* kind of cake.

[laughter]

Shannon: Uh huh!

Roane: Like, literally any kind of cake.

Caroline: Just some kind of cake.

Roane: Like cow patty cake would probably be just fine as far as Redbeard is concerned.

Shannon: *[laughing]* Cow patty cake!

Roane: Because, you know, he's a dog.

Shannon: You pose an interesting statement though. All kinds of cake, because I know one thing that comes up among cake lovers -- you know how they have cake versus pie? There's a very special kind of cake that many would argue is in fact a pie, that many of us like -- cheesecake. And I was thinking that Redbeard would be a big fan of cheesecake. I don't know though, is that something that a dog could handle?

Caroline: Ooh. Well, dogs love cheese.

Roane: Uhh, as long as there's not chocolate?

Shannon: Aha.

Roane: I mean, any kind of sugar is obviously going to be kind of too much and not necessarily healthy, so you might want to watch how much cake he gets.

Shannon: Mm hmm.

Roane: Oh, yeah, we should say that -- that Redbeard absolutely cannot have chocolate cake.

Shannon: Okay.

Caroline: Here's a question, red velvet --

Shannon: Ooh!

Caroline: -- is some kind of chocolate --

Roane: It is.

Caroline: -- that doesn't have chocolate in it, right?

Roane: No, it does, it has cocoa in it.

Caroline: It does have cocoa?

Roane: Yep.

Caroline: Okay. Because just for strictly English language vanity reasons, I kind of like the idea of Redbeard liking red velvet. *[laughing]*

Shannon: Mmm.

Roane: You know, you want to get really technical and talk about how much of the chemical that is harmful to dogs in chocolate is in cocoa, ehhhh --

Shannon: Yes!

Roane: That might be a mailbag question. He might be able to have a little bit of red velvet, because cocoa doesn't have as much of the theobromine as, like, dark chocolate has, for example, that you might find in a richer chocolate cake.

Shannon: I didn't know this. I had heard about chocolate not being good for dogs, but I wasn't sure if it was just like chocolate in its pure form or if he could have it in a baked form. So this is good to know.

[laughter]

Shannon: So we're kind of ruling out chocolate, possibly not the red velvet. You know, part of me was also thinking, also like you, Caroline, you know, also to be poetic, as far as coloring a little bit, you know like strawberry shortcake. I don't know, I just thought that would be cute.

All original content: Copyright By Fans 4 Fans, LLC. Promotional graphics were created by Fox Estacado. See our [Terms](#) for details on use.

Suggested Citation Format: By Fans 4 Fans (Producer). (2015, April 1). The Bitter Brother [Episode 35]. Three Patch Podcast. Podcast retrieved from <http://www.three-patch.com/2015/04/01/episode-35-the-bitter-brother/>

Caroline: Aww.

Roane: I'm trying to remember if strawberries are okay for dogs or not. I think they are.

Shannon: Mmm.

Roane: Sorry, I--I-- *[laughing]* I've done every internet search possible, because when your dog eats something random, you're like "oh crap" --

Caroline: And then throws up. Yeah.

Roane: Yeah, and you're like: do I take them to the vet or not? So.

Shannon: Mm.

Caroline: Yeah. But I think importantly, the answer is: he will not let Mycroft have any.

Roane: Oh god no!

Shannon: No. *[laughing]*

Caroline: Because he's--he's Sherlock's dog.

Roane: Well, and also he's a dog. I mean. Humans will take the cake away, so you have to eat it before it gets to you.

Shannon: Ohhhh. So dogs don't share cake?

Roane: No!

Shannon: Okay. See, that could have an impact on how I sort him. Because I was thinking that dogs might be, you know -- you often hear about them being loyal and I was thinking that maybe they would be perhaps generous, especially if Mycroft looked very hungry or sad.

Caroline: I don't think he would very loyal to -- I mean, I think he would prefer Sherlock to Mycroft --

Shannon: Mm hmm.

All original content: Copyright By Fans 4 Fans, LLC. Promotional graphics were created by Fox Estacado. See our [Terms](#) for details on use.

Suggested Citation Format: By Fans 4 Fans (Producer). (2015, April 1). The Bitter Brother [Episode 35]. Three Patch Podcast. Podcast retrieved from <http://www.three-patch.com/2015/04/01/episode-35-the-bitter-brother/>

Caroline: And therefore he might -- I mean, dogs are very loyal, I think, but they would -- they're not going to...hoard a thing...from the person that the dog's most loyal to?

Shannon: Mm hmm.

Roane: Well...

Caroline: I guess?

[Shannon laughs]

Roane: Well...ehh...lemme tell ya, I had the good fortune to have the sweetest, most loyal dog. The podcast dog, y'all remember Maddie, she used to...

Shannon: Yes.

Roane: -- pant into the phone.

Shannon: Yes. *[laughing]*

Roane: She was the best dog I ever had, but I swear to god, if it was me or her dinner, I would have to get out of the way.

[laughter]

Roane: That's just -- that's just how dogs are. I don't think they share food easily.

Shannon: Mm. Okay.

Roane: I mean, she probably -- if we were in a dire situation and I was dying, she might have. But if it's a question of "I have cake and you don't" -- yeah, sorry. *[laughing]*

Shannon: See, this is also very good to know because I was sitting here and thinking, well, would he share with Mycroft...? And a part of me was thinking, I mean I have this long convoluted history that we'll get to for another question, that let me believe no, he wouldn't, and there's a very good reason why. So Mycroft -- no cake from Redbeard. That's where I'm coming in, too.

Roane: Definitely not.

Shannon: Dog or not. But yeah, Mycroft is definitely in trouble.

Caroline: I'm at least going to put Sherlock ahead of Mycroft in the "will he let him have cake" thing.

Shannon: Okay.

Roane: Fair enough.

Caroline: Mycroft is behind Sherlock in that regard.

Shannon: *[laughing]* Well, with all this cake eating, this leads us to our next question, which is one that I initially dismissed, but Roane, you set me right. And the question was: does he lift his leg or squat? And I thought, well --

[laughter]

Roane: So here's this funny thing about dogs. And I'm sure people who might know more about dogs might write in and correct us, and please do, but my -- again, personal experience -- dogs don't always lift their leg until they're older. Like, puppies don't lift their legs.

Shannon: Mm hmm.

Roane: And so sometimes dogs that are very puppyish in their demeanor don't ever lift their leg.

Shannon: Oh!

Roane: My ex-roommate had a big friendly doofus of a lab, who, according to her -- and I have no reason to doubt her -- never lifted his leg until the age of 2, when she took him to a dog park --

Caroline: And he saw other dogs?

Roane: And he saw other male dogs lifting their legs. And she's convinced the other dogs were making fun of him because he was squatting.

Shannon: Aww.

All original content: Copyright By Fans 4 Fans, LLC. Promotional graphics were created by Fox Estacado. See our [Terms](#) for details on use.

Suggested Citation Format: By Fans 4 Fans (Producer). (2015, April 1). The Bitter Brother [Episode 35]. Three Patch Podcast. Podcast retrieved from <http://www.three-patch.com/2015/04/01/episode-35-the-bitter-brother/>

Caroline: I feel like that might've happened to Sherlock.

Shannon: What, that Sherlock doesn't lift his leg when he pees either?

[laughter]

Caroline: You know how they have that line with Mycroft about like "how we didn't know anything until we met other children and ugh how pathetic that was"? And if you think about it, if Mycroft is supposed to be 7 years older than him, that is a long time --

Shannon: Yeah.

Caroline: -- where Mycroft had not met any children. *[laughing]* Right?

Shannon: That's kind of unusual.

Caroline: Right. Maybe he's not 7 years older in *this* canon, as opposed to, you know, ACD canon, but the idea is a little strange that they were completely by themselves, with no children around. Although who knows, mummy Holmes is brilliant, maybe she homeschooled.

Roane: I can definitely see Redbeard not lifting his leg until he was older, and I can see Sherlock being really really worried about it. Like, you know --

[laughter and awws]

Roane: My dog is broken, he's not doing the right thing.

Caroline: And there was no googling!

Roane: No!

Shannon: Yes! Excellent headcanon, Roane. This is very upsetting. Hmm.

Roane: Being very worried that his dog is peeing wrong.

Shannon: Yeah. Well, when you mentioned dogs potentially being very puppyish, we saw a glimpse of Redbeard running to Sherlock in his mind palace. I mean, we got to see him action. I

mean, he had gorgeous hair, but did he seem puppyish or could you not get much of a read at that moment? He just seemed really happy.

Caroline: I thought he was an older dog in the mind palace.

Roane: Yeah, his behavior wasn't puppyish, his behavior was pretty much pure Irish Setter. Irish Setters are really enthusiastic and really energetic. So we saw some of that, but we also saw presumably the older and sicker Redbeard who wasn't -- yeah.

Caroline: Yeah, that's definitely what I read, was that -- especially in the shot in the mind palace where you see Redbeard get up to go to Sherlock --

Shannon: Mm hmm.

Roane: Yeah.

Caroline: And that's when Sherlock switches from child!Sherlock, you know, Louis Moffat, hey, to adult!Sherlock. The way that the dog got up on its hind legs, and started running --

Shannon: Mm hmm.

Roane: Yeah.

Caroline: I was like, *that* is an older dog.

Roane: I think we saw him at some point younger though.

Caroline: I think that they only had one dog actor.

Roane: Really? I could've sworn we saw like a younger version of him and maybe I'm confusing fic and reality. This -- this happens.

[laughter]

Shannon: Yes!

Caroline: It definitely does happen.

Shannon: We saw him running and then we saw him licking, right? Because that's when Sherlock says, "They're putting me down, too."

Caroline: Yes.

Shannon: And so I feel like -- I mean, maybe it's the same dog, but when we first see Redbeard, he's very poised, like sitting there elegantly, that's how I would describe it. And then he gets up and runs. And then there's all this joyous face-licking. And so I don't know enough about Irish Setters, but maybe that's it, that seemed like overjoyed behavior?

Roane: And that's pretty typical, they're very happy dogs.

Shannon: Mmm. So at any age, they would act that way. That's not a puppy --

Roane: Yeah.

Shannon: That's an Irish Setter.

Caroline: But I do think I remember reading the name of the dog that played Redbeard.

Shannon: Uh huh.

Caroline: And it was just the one name. It was like Arthur or something like that. It was just the one --

Shannon: Like Madonna.

[laughter]

Caroline: But I mean, it wasn't like 2 dogs, one was the younger Redbeard and one was the older Redbeard. You know what I mean?

Shannon: Uh huh, right, right.

Roane: Well, it's not difficult to teach a dog how to limp. So, I mean. They could have him running in one scene and limping in another one.

Caroline: [laughing] I'm actually now trying to look up who the dog was, because I swear it was just -- a name.

All original content: Copyright By Fans 4 Fans, LLC. Promotional graphics were created by Fox Estacado. See our [Terms](#) for details on use.

Suggested Citation Format: By Fans 4 Fans (Producer). (2015, April 1). The Bitter Brother [Episode 35]. Three Patch Podcast. Podcast retrieved from <http://www.three-patch.com/2015/04/01/episode-35-the-bitter-brother/>

Shannon: This idea -- while you look that up, Caroline, this idea that you had, Roane, of possibly a limp or something like that. Is it habit amongst dogs when they age that if they have, let's say, joint problems that they return to squatting if leg lifting becomes a problem? Or do they never abandon that?

[Caroline snorts]

Roane: Oh yes. Yeah. They definitely do, my older dog did that. I know, this is such a ridiculous conversation, but I love it.

[laughter]

Shannon: Blame Dixie!

Roane: You're letting me talk about dogs, I'm so happy.

[laughter]

Caroline: Yeah, but we're talking about dogs *peeing*, it's really weird. All right, fine.

Shannon: What else are we going to do, talk about how they do their taxes or what they did in school?

Caroline: Ahh.

Roane: So here's the thing, anybody who has kids or anybody who has a lot of pets, inevitably the conversation just goes to pee and poop, it just happens. So.

[laughter]

Roane: Younger kids, especially.

Caroline: Sherlock Holmes in BBC canon does make a lot of, you know, penis and pooping jokes and stuff like that, so.

Shannon: Yeah!

Roane: That's true, there's the infamous --

All original content: Copyright By Fans 4 Fans, LLC. Promotional graphics were created by Fox Estacado. See our [Terms](#) for details on use.

Suggested Citation Format: By Fans 4 Fans (Producer). (2015, April 1). The Bitter Brother [Episode 35]. Three Patch Podcast. Podcast retrieved from <http://www.three-patch.com/2015/04/01/episode-35-the-bitter-brother/>

Caroline: Really, it's John Watson. But you know Sherlock likes him so hey.

Shannon: *[laughing]* Yeah!

Roane: There's the infamous "going to see a man about a dog" joke.

Caroline: Yeah! Which comes on the heels of "yeah I think I might've already taken care of that." You know? With the -- excretion?

Shannon: Yep. That's right. Excreted it. *[laughing]*

Roane: Poop jokes.

Shannon: And that was an episode about dogs!

Roane: Yes, it was.

Shannon: Or hounds. Hound.

Caroline: Yep, one that got shot though. *[laughing]*

Shannon: Right, well.

Caroline: Mm.

Shannon: But speaking of getting shot, what do you think happened to Redbeard? I mean, as far as we hear Sherlock saying to Redbeard, "Well, they're putting me down too." So I extracted from that that Redbeard was put down. But what do you think his story is? What happened to him?

Caroline: Part of my headcanon is -- and I think I might've read this -- and I don't even know if this was a fic or not, but I think I read this somewhere, where Redbeard was Sherlock's first case. Like, he went away to the farm, to the whatever --

Shannon: Ohh.

Caroline: To the vet, and Sherlock didn't actually piece together happened until later. Like, what actually happened to Redbeard.

All original content: Copyright By Fans 4 Fans, LLC. Promotional graphics were created by Fox Estacado. See our [Terms](#) for details on use.

Suggested Citation Format: By Fans 4 Fans (Producer). (2015, April 1). The Bitter Brother [Episode 35]. Three Patch Podcast. Podcast retrieved from <http://www.three-patch.com/2015/04/01/episode-35-the-bitter-brother/>

Roane: Aww!

Caroline: *[laughing]* I know, right? Isn't that the saddest?

Roane: That's horrible.

Caroline: *[still laughing]* I know! I know it is! But like, it's really -- it's obviously traumatic, but then again in the mind palace he does know that Redbeard was put down. I mean, maybe that's something that he put together on but it's a really sad headcanon that, you know, that that was his first friend and he kind of lost him and didn't know what was going on and kind of had a thing anyway with mysteries, right? So he fixated. I don't know, it's really sad, I'm sorry I brought that up! *[laughs]*

Shannon: Yeah, that is sad.

Roane: Well, you know, we're talking about dogs dying, it's sad.

Shannon: Yeah.

Roane: My impression just from watching the show was that he had just gotten old, you know?

Shannon: Mm hmm.

Roane: Big dogs sadly just don't live as long as little dogs just as a general rule. So if he had Redbeard as a puppy when Sherlock was 6 or 7, by the time he was 14 or 15, you know, Redbeard would be an old old dog.

Shannon: Mm.

Roane: My personal headcanon just sitting here thinking about it is, assuming that Sherlock was in boarding school, that Redbeard getting being put down just because of advanced age while Sherlock was away at school would be pretty awful.

Caroline: Aww.

Shannon: Oh, yeah. Oh, how upsetting. Yeah. Well, I had a maybe slightly convoluted backstory, because I was thinking a bit about this tension that I perceived between Mycroft and Redbeard. Like, I feel like there's a kind of sibling rivalry going on between them for Sherlock's

All original content: Copyright By Fans 4 Fans, LLC. Promotional graphics were created by Fox Estacado. See our [Terms](#) for details on use.

Suggested Citation Format: By Fans 4 Fans (Producer). (2015, April 1). The Bitter Brother [Episode 35]. Three Patch Podcast. Podcast retrieved from <http://www.three-patch.com/2015/04/01/episode-35-the-bitter-brother/>

affection. So let me explain where I'm coming from. Because this is clearly -- we don't have a lot of evidence of it -- but that Mycroft uses Redbeard to taunt or remind Sherlock, to me is a sign to me that this may have been a point of tension between them. And I can perceive that Sherlock was young when Redbeard entered his life, so if like you're saying, Roane, that he was 6 or 7, I almost believe that it's possible that Redbeard was even older, so that he entered Sherlock's life early, like, do you ever see those pieces of fanart where Sherlock is a little infant and then there's a little puppy?

Roane: Yeah.

Caroline: Yeah.

Shannon: And I can almost see that like Redbeard was brought in to be Mycroft's companion when this little baby needs the parents' attention so Mycroft doesn't get jealous, but what ends up happening is that a bond forms between Redbeard and Sherlock, and that that may be when Redbeard -- and I can also believe that he became ill or age and infirmity is what led him to being put down, but this talk about him having a bad leg, it could be illness too. But I perceived of Sherlock losing Redbeard much earlier, but not at 14 or 15, but even when they were young.

Roane: Yeah.

Shannon: And that leaving kind of a scar but that Mycroft maybe have a kind of jealousy that, you know, Sherlock had this bond that still hurts him. You know, that he's still vulnerable to. And we can see how Mycroft, when he talks about "your loss would break my heart," I believe him when he says that. And Sherlock doesn't reciprocate, so I almost feel like the older brother looked out for the two younger brothers, but there was a little bit of jealousy over the closeness that existed between Redbeard and Sherlock, and so it was Sherlock who was the more anguished when he lost Redbeard because that was his play companion in a way, because Mycroft was a bit older.

Roane: Mm.

Shannon: So, when I joked about there being tension between Mycroft and Redbeard and Redbeard not having Mycroft having the cake, I would think it's because he might pick up on maybe Mycroft's jealousy. So he wouldn't share his cake.

Caroline: Did you just call Redbeard the other brother though?

Shannon: Yep.

All original content: Copyright By Fans 4 Fans, LLC. Promotional graphics were created by Fox Estacado. See our [Terms](#) for details on use.

Suggested Citation Format: By Fans 4 Fans (Producer). (2015, April 1). The Bitter Brother [Episode 35]. Three Patch Podcast. Podcast retrieved from <http://www.three-patch.com/2015/04/01/episode-35-the-bitter-brother/>

Roane: Yes, she did.

Shannon: Yep.

Caroline: Okay. I'm just not sure *Mycroft* would consider him that way, I guess. That's the -- you know, from his perspective.

Roane: If anything, I think it's when Sherlock calls Mycroft at the wedding and Mycroft's like "remember Redbeard," I think to Mycroft Redbeard was a cautionary tale against getting close to anything.

Caroline: Yes. I subscribe to that.

Roane: And so, you know, for Mycroft, Redbeard is like a warning. Like, "don't do that again. Didn't you learn the last time not to get attached to things?" Which is...sad.

Shannon: Yeah.

Caroline: Yeah. Just so you know, I did find out, Redbeard is played by a not professional dog... *[laughing]* not professionally trained acting dog, that is.

[laughter]

Caroline: This was his first acting gig and his name is Murray.

Roane: Aww, look at him.

Shannon: Murray! Whose dog is he, does he belong to someone in the crew?

Caroline: Uh, owned by someone named Anthea Crowe. I don't know who that is.

Shannon: Probably Moffat's neighbor.

Caroline: I don't know! The name's Anthea, right?

Shannon: *[laughing]* Yes.

Caroline: Anthea! She's Anthea's dog, no, I don't know.

All original content: Copyright By Fans 4 Fans, LLC. Promotional graphics were created by Fox Estacado. See our [Terms](#) for details on use.

Suggested Citation Format: By Fans 4 Fans (Producer). (2015, April 1). The Bitter Brother [Episode 35]. Three Patch Podcast.

Podcast retrieved from <http://www.three-patch.com/2015/04/01/episode-35-the-bitter-brother/>

Roane: Aww, look at him. We're looking at pictures -- we'll have to link to this -- but he's such a cutie!

Shannon: Aww.

Roane: I want to snuggle him.

[laughter]

Caroline: He seems like a very sweet dog.

Shannon: Do they have his age, so we know how old he is?

Caroline: Umm, no.

Shannon: Or is that something you don't ask a dog because that's kind of rude?

[laughter]

Caroline: I don't see anything about it.

[laughter]

Shannon: Well it's good to know. Murray did an excellent job and was very compelling and heartwarming.

Caroline: Yeah.

Shannon: Well anyway, my convoluted headcanon was just a bit of crack here, inspired by the whole sorting. And so, I think it would make a great piece of fic. *[laughing]*

Caroline: I actually think I have read that Redbeard was supposed to be Mycroft's dog, but Redbeard and Sherlock bonded and so Mycroft -- the way that he is -- let Sherlock have him, because what *doesn't* Mycroft do for Sherlock?

Shannon: True, true.

Caroline: Yeah.

All original content: Copyright By Fans 4 Fans, LLC. Promotional graphics were created by Fox Estacado. See our [Terms](#) for details on use.

Suggested Citation Format: By Fans 4 Fans (Producer). (2015, April 1). The Bitter Brother [Episode 35]. Three Patch Podcast. Podcast retrieved from <http://www.three-patch.com/2015/04/01/episode-35-the-bitter-brother/>

Shannon: So based on our discussion so far and all this evidence, what house would you sort Redbeard into?

Roane: Well, I'm kind of the opinion that almost all dogs are Hufflepuff.

Shannon: Mm hmm.

Roane: So I would definitely say Hufflepuff.

Shannon: Okay. So even though he won't share his cake? *[laughing]*

Roane: Yeah, even though.

Caroline: I'm really for this too. I mean, I think occasionally I think if you've got a Lassie kind of dog, then that's probably more like a Gryffindor. Although I don't know.

Roane: Yeah. Certain breeds, I think. But generally, I think Hufflepuff because they're so loyal and dedicated.

Shannon: Mm.

Caroline: Yeah. Yeah, yeah. Also it's a working breed. Irish Setter, so I would think --

Shannon: Hardworking?

Caroline: Hardworking, yeah, I would think. Probably really good at finding items? So um --

Shannon: Ohh, a finder.

Roane: Yes! Definitely a finder!

Caroline: *[laughing]* Right? So, yeah, I think that just works out really well. And I think it also -- I get into trouble a lot when I say this on twitter, because I am friends with a cat vet who likes to reem into me about it, but I think that Sherlock is such a dog person and I think that he likes to pretend that he's not. I think he likes to pretend he's a cat person, and I think that makes so much sense to me that that's why he's attracted to John, in a way. *[giggling]*

Shannon: Uh huh!

All original content: Copyright By Fans 4 Fans, LLC. Promotional graphics were created by Fox Estacado. See our [Terms](#) for details on use.

Suggested Citation Format: By Fans 4 Fans (Producer). (2015, April 1). The Bitter Brother [Episode 35]. Three Patch Podcast.

Podcast retrieved from <http://www.three-patch.com/2015/04/01/episode-35-the-bitter-brother/>

Roane: I could see that!

Caroline: Not to say that Sherlock *is* a dog or that John *is* a dog, but I think that the dog-like quality of certain houses, like the loyalty situation, you know -- bravery and all this, I think that that appeals to him and I think there's a certain sincerity that he needs and wants in his life, but doesn't have, and -- somehow this all makes sense to me in my head and I can't really --

Roane: No, I'm with you! I'm with you.

Shannon: So John is like a stand-in for Redbeard?

Roane: Yeah! He totally is.

Caroline: *[laughing]* I think so! But I'm trying to say that in a way makes John sound terrible, like a dog.

Roane: It doesn't!

Caroline: I'm not saying he's a dog.

Shannon: It's not!

Roane: You know, there are worse things than to be compared to a really friendly, really loyal dog.

[laughter]

Shannon: Yeah!

Caroline: Yeah, I know, I know, this is just me trying to make the point that this is not in any way me trying to insult John.

Roane: No! No!

Caroline: Like, not in anyway. I think it's a great thing!

Roane: John is like the dog that is really sweet and really friendly and will show people into the house and show them where the silver is, but if you go near his person with a threatening move, he will tear your face off.

Shannon: Yes.

Caroline: Right. He's a dog with a sig. So...

[laughter]

Roane: Yes! I have no problems with that, and I say that as a John fangirl.

Shannon: Yeah, and remember, Roane, when we were on the sorting John roundtable, one of the questions had to do with his animagus form.

Caroline: Mmm.

Shannon: And a lot of us thought a different type of dog.

Roane: Yep.

Shannon: So, Caroline, what you're saying, I think, is the same thing many other people pick up on.

Roane: Yeah.

Shannon: That he has qualities that we often associate with a loyal dog -- a well-trained, dangerous dog.

Caroline: Right? And there's also something about him being in the military and being very pack-like.

Roane: Yep.

Shannon: Uh huh.

Caroline: Very much needing that sort of structure.

Shannon: Structure.

All original content: Copyright By Fans 4 Fans, LLC. Promotional graphics were created by Fox Estacado. See our [Terms](#) for details on use.

Suggested Citation Format: By Fans 4 Fans (Producer). (2015, April 1). The Bitter Brother [Episode 35]. Three Patch Podcast. Podcast retrieved from <http://www.three-patch.com/2015/04/01/episode-35-the-bitter-brother/>

Caroline: And the whole “previous commander” and “ex commander” and all that, there’s something about the sort of alpha nature that comes out or is loyal or whatever -- that is, he is a bit of both. There’s something about that interaction or structure that makes a lot of *sense* for John Watson, that to me as a *Sherlock* fangirl, that makes a lot of sense, and I’m like yes, all of that! I mean, yes. There are times that I think that Sherlock is a cat person too. But mostly I err on the “he’s a dog person who’s trying to convince the world that he’s a cat person.”

Shannon: I think Sherlock is more cat-*like*.

Roane: Yes.

Shannon: So he doesn’t necessarily have to be a cat person so much as he exhibits those qualities of a cat, and is drawn to --

Caroline: Dogs.

Shannon: People who are different from him, yeah.

Roane: He’s a cat who needs a dog.

Shannon: Exactly! And we know those.

Roane: I have one, so yes.

Shannon: Aww. So, when we talked about sorting Redbeard previously, this came up, the idea that all dogs are Hufflepuff, and I can sort of buy into that. And then we might say that all cats are Slytherin. But then I thought, you know, I just want to be a little different here. And I thought long and hard about my little backstory and I thought -- if we’re going to say that it’s possible for dogs to have other qualities, I could see Redbeard being a Slytherin in some ways, and that that is why he won’t share his cake with Mycroft and --

[laughter]

Shannon: And there’s a kind of tension between them. And I have another thing to say about this with our next question, but I perceive of, you know, Sherlock likes in John as well when John takes the mickey out of Mycroft and is not intimidated by him?

Roane: Yeah.

All original content: Copyright By Fans 4 Fans, LLC. Promotional graphics were created by Fox Estacado. See our [Terms](#) for details on use.

Suggested Citation Format: By Fans 4 Fans (Producer). (2015, April 1). The Bitter Brother [Episode 35]. Three Patch Podcast. Podcast retrieved from <http://www.three-patch.com/2015/04/01/episode-35-the-bitter-brother/>

Caroline: Mm hmm.

Shannon: And kinda like, you know, plays with him a bit? So I think that I could see a mischievous potential in Redbeard, a slyness to, like, colluding with Sherlock to get back at the elder brother who's kind of a bit stuffy and in the way, and having fun with it, and when he doesn't get that cake, you know, taking revenge. Because, you know, maybe dogs might not be about power, but they might be about food.

Caroline: *[laughing]* Ambition for food.

Shannon: And cake.

Roane: Yes.

[laughter]

Shannon: Yes, that's his ambition. To have all the cake.

Roane: My experience is that dogs are definitely about food.

Caroline: Okay, well, in that case, I'm going to go ahead and say that if he were the kind of dog that is all about digging up bones, I'm going to call Ravenclaw.

Shannon: Ooh!

Roane: Eh?

Caroline: It's the only thing, if he's super obsessed with bones, that's all I got.

Shannon: So like bone knowledge? Or?

Caroline: Right? Because it reminds me of Sherlock with a chemistry set. But like --

Shannon: Ahh.

Caroline: *[laughing]* But it's with bones. It makes no sense. Maybe the bleach has gone to my head.

Shannon: Yeah.

[laughter]

Caroline: I'm in foils. I should just say this. I have the most crack setup right now, with my glasses half off my head, with foil up in my bangs, I can't -- the things I do for purple hair, man. I don't --

[laughter]

Shannon: The things you do for this podcast; you ran out of your appointment while your hair is being dyed.

Caroline: I did, I did. I look completely preposterous. I'd take a picture but my phone ran out of batteries, so that's how terrible everything was today. *[laughing]*

Shannon: Well, let's bring it home with with our final question to wrap up the sorting. And this one is a more Harry Potter related question, and that is: can a dog have a patronus? And if so, what is Redbeard's?

Roane: Okay, so the patronus -- let me make sure because I'm the Harry Potter, like, not newbie but, like, baby -- the patronus is like the protective spirit that you summon when you really need them to, right?

Shannon: Right, when you draw upon intense -- like, the happiest memory.

Roane: Well then, I think his patronus is...Sherlock.

[gasps and awws]

Roane: Because I think if any dog has a patronus, it's a person.

Shannon: Mm hmm, I like this. I like this. Because I was thinking the same thing.

Caroline: Yeah, I mean, it's either that or it's going to be chasing after a squirrel.

Shannon: Or it's a cake!

Roane: Vengeful cake!

All original content: Copyright By Fans 4 Fans, LLC. Promotional graphics were created by Fox Estacado. See our [Terms](#) for details on use.

Suggested Citation Format: By Fans 4 Fans (Producer). (2015, April 1). The Bitter Brother [Episode 35]. Three Patch Podcast. Podcast retrieved from <http://www.three-patch.com/2015/04/01/episode-35-the-bitter-brother/>

[laughter]

Shannon: So I thought, exactly like you, Roane, in fact, there was a great fic out there that dealt with this concept, and I shouldn't say anything about it because that kind of spoils it, but maybe you guys know it, and it has the idea of someone's patronus actually being a human being and being mistaken for a human being and not a patronus, and that's -- the question is --

Caroline: Wait, are we talking about a patronus or are we talking about a His Dark Materials crossover?

Shannon: No -- well...

Caroline: Because His Dark Materials, I definitely know that fic...

Roane: It's a very similar concept between the two.

Shannon: Mm hmm.

Roane: I think.

Caroline: Except that patronuses look like green smoke.

Shannon: Yeah, so maybe I'm wrong here. Maybe I'm wrong here.

Caroline: But they're very similar ideas. Right? Like you get a totem basically.

Roane: Yeah.

Caroline: Like, they're extremely similar ideas, which is why I get it.

Shannon: I feel like I read a fic somewhere where it was unusual that someone's patronus was a human, but you're right, I think this was a different one. But in any case, the whole idea of Redbeard's patronus being human, I thought yeah, that makes sense. And unlike you, Roane, I wasn't thinking of it being Sherlock, because he has Sherlock in person, but I thought if he was initially supposed to belong to Mycroft, or you know he was brought in, and because Mycroft is also the protective elder brother, I actually think his patronus is Mycroft. And Mycroft doesn't like that. Because you can imagine how Mycroft might feel, saying "this dog has me as a patronus, this is annoying."

All original content: Copyright By Fans 4 Fans, LLC. Promotional graphics were created by Fox Estacado. See our [Terms](#) for details on use.

Suggested Citation Format: By Fans 4 Fans (Producer). (2015, April 1). The Bitter Brother [Episode 35]. Three Patch Podcast. Podcast retrieved from <http://www.three-patch.com/2015/04/01/episode-35-the-bitter-brother/>

[laughter]

Shannon: You know, “This is not special in any way, stop it.” And I bet that Sherlock and Redbeard use Redbeard’s patronus to tease Mycroft. I totally see that.

Roane: I could see that.

[laughter]

Caroline: I don’t know why, but I really want it to be mummy Holmes.

Shannon: Aww.

Roane: Oh, that could be too.

Caroline: I don’t know why, because I feel like mummy Holmes would have picked him out and brought him home for the boys?

Roane: Aww.

Caroline: And I feel like she would’ve been really sweet. But otherwise, I would default to Sherlock, yeah.

Shannon: All right!

Caroline: Or a squirrel that he chases around.

[laughter]

Shannon: A squirrel! A dog chases his own patronus. That’s kind of --

Caroline: I mean, right? I don’t know, think he’d just be like “SQUIRREL!” and then just go. I think that would be really happy.

Shannon: It’d be hard to cast a patronus without a wand, so I mean this is all a rather theoretical, abstract discussion. We’d have to bring in Rowling to see if it’s possible.

Caroline: There was that one guy in the Harry Potter movie though that didn’t need a wand.

All original content: Copyright By Fans 4 Fans, LLC. Promotional graphics were created by Fox Estacado. See our [Terms](#) for details on use.

Suggested Citation Format: By Fans 4 Fans (Producer). (2015, April 1). The Bitter Brother [Episode 35]. Three Patch Podcast. Podcast retrieved from <http://www.three-patch.com/2015/04/01/episode-35-the-bitter-brother/>

Shannon: Because he could do wandless magic?

Caroline: Yeah.

Shannon: Yeah. So yeah, maybe Redbeard can do wandless magic. Dogs do wandless magic.

Roane: Yeah, I know, but who's going to look twice at a dog carrying a stick though?

[laughter]

Shannon: Good point! Good point! There we go. The next time you see a dog with a stick in his mouth, watch out. That's a wand.

Roane: It's a wand.

Caroline: *[laughing]* That was brilliant. Oh, that was brilliant.

Shannon: All right, guys, I think we have sufficiently sorted Redbeard. Thank you so much.

Caroline: Thank you!

Roane: Oh, this was fun.

Caroline: It was really fun!

Shannon: Bye!

Roane: Bye!

Caroline: Bye!

Music fades in/out.